

**Minutes of Cameron Community Council Meeting held in Cameron Hall
on 15th October at 6.30pm**

- Present:** Gordon Ball (Chairman), Janice Tomlinson, Jennifer Wylie, Bruce Thomson, David Brown, David Scott
- Attending:** Cllr McGregor, Martin Tomlinson, Jennifer Ball, Carol Drysdale, Nick Mifsud, D Symington, Peter Jerome, Marian Lang, John Christie, Rosalind Rentoul, Graham Lang, Ian Straith, Tom Hedley, Hamish Lohoar, Linda Holt, Sander Adam (Ogin), Peter Pawlowski (Ogin)
- Apologies:** Stephen Lohoar, John Wils, Cllr Riches, Cllr Docherty
- Welcome:** GB welcomed all
- Minutes:** Acceptance of minutes 24th September proposed by Jennifer Wylie and seconded by Bruce Thomson

Temporis Wind Presentation - Claremont Farm:

Two screening applications have been submitted to Fife Council for wind turbines to be located at land south west of Claremont Farm belonging to Alan Myles of Claremont Farm (14/00570 (single turbine) and 14/02568 (three turbines). Temporis Wind approached CCC to ask if they could attend a meeting with the community to discuss the proposed development and the opportunity for shared ownership. Temporis Wind is a developer, owner and operator of wind turbine projects in the UK. Two representatives from Ogin the turbine manufacturers attended the meeting to discuss the screening application 14/02568 which relates to the turbines they manufacture, they believe that Temporis will be withdrawing 14/00570 for the single turbine.

Ogin advised :-

- they are working with Temporis in other sites in Scotland
- in other countries turbines are usually owned by the electricity companies
- they have been in discussion with Mr Myles regarding locating some of these in his land at Claremont Farm. (Claremont Farm buildings are in Strathkinness Community Council area, but the land being proposed for the turbines is in the Cameron Area).
- The Ogin turbine differs from the standard turbines as it has a shroud and the blade spins within this. Ogin reports that this is more environmentally friendly and less invasive to radar signature - they are working with the American Government and the MOD. Their turbine uses less CO2 and is less harmful to birds. The turbines Ogin build are smaller 45m to the top of the shroud, many other turbines are typically 120m to blade tip.
- There are two ways the community can benefit 1) community benefit payment, where the community are provided with an agreed amount by the developer 2) the community can invest and then benefit from this investment. There are a number of subsidies available eg CARES (Community and Renewable Energy Scheme, this scheme was established by the Scottish Government to encourage local and community ownership of renewable energy across Scotland).
- Ogin advised they were happy to follow up with a more detailed presentation once they have gauged the queries and reactions from the community.

Question / Answer session followed

Q In what way are the Ogin turbines more efficient

A A drop in pressure behind the blade shroud causes more air to flow over the blade, so generating more electricity. The Aerofoil has 10 segments allowing more mixing of air, Ogin reported the turbines work better than predicted.

Q Are you saying that this is more efficient than the Betz equation (NB **Betz's law** calculates the maximum power that can be extracted from the wind, independent of the design of a wind turbine in open flow).

- A The Ogin turbine does not break the Betz theory. Their turbine works in multiple directions, the BETZ theory claims a maximum 30% efficiency while their turbines are approximately double that.
- Q What size is the turbine
- A The proposed turbine is 45m high to the top of the shroud, with the shroud having 20m outer diameter and 5m to 7m in depth.
- Q What is the noise level
- A There is less noise because of the shroud and because the turbine is nearer the ground the noise dissipates quicker.
- Then followed a general discussion around the wording of the screening application on Fife Council's Planning site.
- Q With regards to the environmental friendliness, birds were mentioned, what about horses, cattle etc
- A Environmental studies show there is no impact to livestock
- Q What about shadow flicker
- A Because the blade rotates in the shroud flicker is reduced
- Q What is the life span of the turbine?
- A 20-25 years of commercial use, but it has a theoretical use of 50 years
- Q Is this the first in the UK
- A One is planned for just outside Manchester, they do not anticipate any radar implications at this site
- Q What revenue is anticipated from this proposal
- A Approximately 10-15% per year of initial capital investment. The following can be expected 1) Community benefit fund £2.5K annually 2) Anticipated £1M investment is required for all 3 turbines - 10-15% of the investment the community made to this.
- Q With knowledge of another site where new technology was proposed, CARES advised that the community would not get a loan, as the technology was unproved. What data can Ogin provide to prove the reliability of this design?
- A Due to height restrictions in Northern California they are looking at placing 400 turbines 1m apart. They will be starting construction of 120 at the end of this year. There is one currently installed in Boston harbour. The US banks have provided financial support based on Ogin data.
- Q Is there any community interest in the Manchester proposal?
- A Potentially may be interest from Local Council
- Q How many turbines are being produced per week
- A They are currently building 8, one of these will be tested, the other 7 will then be erected, they will then move ahead with the other 113. Next year they anticipate having 30 sites up and running.
- Q Why was the land the northwest of Claremont Farm chosen, which is not at the top of a hill, and not in a windy area. An Anemometer installed in that area several years ago did not produce very good wind readings.
- A The Ogin design can cope with lower wind force, and the radar is mitigated because the turbine is shorter.
- Q If Temporis can't get this taken up as a community project will they proceed with this application
- A The preference is for a local involvement, but they will be seeking investment from other sources.
- Q The current Feed-in Tariff is being reduced next year, is this a rush job
- A Their costing is based on the lower tariff
- Q What is the financial driver and what is the attraction for the community
- A The financial benefit goes to proportionally to the investors
- Q Other communities have got involved in similar schemes and did not get the promised return and are now in financial difficulties
- A The Scottish Government gives a loan and as part of that the financial viability is looked at. Other countries turbines are part community owned, in Denmark the community own 100%.
- Q Can Ogin produce a paper proving their turbines are more efficient than the other commercially available turbines?
- A A paper is available where the commercial sensitive data has been removed - based on installations in the US. The data was initially based on theoretical data but they can now provide real data. (Ogin agreed to provide this.)
- Q When the windspeed is high the current turbines are turned off, will this be the same with their design.
- A Yes, their turbines will work up to 190 kmph approx 130mph
- Q Where is the generating equipment?
- A Everything is contained within the shroud, the electricity is carried down the tower where it is connected to the grid.

Matters Arising:

Applications/Nominations for Cameron CC and date of Inaugural meeting: Three new residents in the area have agreed to be nominated: Carol Drysdale, Bruce Thomson and Ian Paul. Jennifer Wylie and John Wils have decided to stand down from the CC. All nominations have to be proposed and seconded and lodged with Fife Council by 4pm tomorrow. The date of the Inaugural Meeting was agreed with Cllr Macgregor to be 19th November.

ENCAP meeting update: Lesley Campbell from STAR Development and Toby Anstruther chaired a meeting in the Dreel Halls in Anstruther on the 9th October. Lesley provided an update from the sessions held with the CC's in the East Neuk, she will be circulating the notes of that meeting to everyone that attended the previous meetings STAR held with CC's. The action planning toolkit will be delivered at a meeting which is currently planned for January 2015.

Planning Matters:

1) **14/03222/PPP** Lawhead Of Radernie Radernie Peat Inn Cupar Fife KY15 5LN. Planning permission in principle for erection of dwellinghouse and formation of vehicular access 2) **14/02792/FULL** The Lodge Lathones Largoward Leven Fife KY9 1JE Single storey extension to rear of dwellinghouse - Permitted 3) **14/03104/FULL** Priorletham St Andrews Fife Change of use of forestry land to holiday accommodation site including erection of 21 lodges, electricity substation, sewage treatment facility and formation of access (variation of condition 1 of planning permission 05/04061/EFULL to remove reference to "letting period") - previous application was accepted and foundations for one chalet laid - so work 'officially started' against previous app. 4) **14/03105/FULL** Priorletham Farmhouse Priorletham St Andrews Fife KY16 8NP Change of use, alter and extend agricultural buildings to form 3 dwellings for holiday occupation and change of use of agricultural land to form parking and amenity space (removal of condition 1 of planning permission 04/04357/EFULL - delete the word "letting" and to allow the 3 holiday dwellings to operate independently of Priorletham Farm and variation of condition 7 - to alter single stay occupancy period from one calendar month to 12 continuous weeks). Dwelling built and in use - this to change occupation period.

5) **Melville Estates** have notified us of the pre-planning application for a new development at land north of the Craigton Road.

Correspondence:

Community Council Grant 2014/15: The forms for this have been completed by DB and will be submitted to FC.

AOCB:

Cllr Mcgregor advised that the NE Fife Planning Meeting had ®rejected the application for 2 houses at Balone Steading ®rejected the proposal for the Visitor Centre on West Sands ®approved St Andrews University proposals for the use of Guardbridge Papermill.

Peat Inn Traffic Calming Cllr McGregor advised the speed survey in the village will be held soon after the October school holiday and this will be feedback to CCC, any alternative measures will be included in next financial year's budget. The Design Brief will be worked up in the New Year and this will be open to consultation with the Community.

There being no further business the meeting closed at 8.10pm

Next Meeting Wednesday 19th November 2014 at 6:30pm

| | |
|----------|------------------|
| Signed | Gordon Ball |
| Proposed | David Brown |
| Seconded | Carol Drysdale |
| Dated | 19 November 2014 |